



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/712,042	11/14/2003	Alan H. Anderson	7707.0019-01	7524
22852	7590	01/10/2008	EXAMINER	
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW, GARRETT & DUNNER LLP 901 NEW YORK AVENUE, NW WASHINGTON, DC 20001-4413			DINH, TIEN QUANG	
ART UNIT		PAPER NUMBER		
3644				
MAIL DATE		DELIVERY MODE		
01/10/2008		PAPER		

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Office Action Summary	Application No.	Applicant(s)	
	10/712,042	ANDERSON ET AL.	
	Examiner Tien Dinh	Art Unit 3644	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --
Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 16 October 2007.
 2a) This action is **FINAL**. 2b) This action is non-final.
 3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

4) Claim(s) 15-28,30,45-58 and 60 is/are pending in the application.
 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
 5) Claim(s) 45-58 and 60 is/are allowed.
 6) Claim(s) 15-17,20-22,28 and 30 is/are rejected.
 7) Claim(s) 18, 19, 23-27 is/are objected to.
 8) Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
 10) The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner.
 Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
 Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
 a) All b) Some * c) None of:
 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)	4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)
2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)	Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____
3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)	5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application
Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____. _____	6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____

DETAILED ACTION

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

Please note that the claims as written are product by process claims. Product by process claims are not limited to the manipulations of the recited steps, only the structure implied by the steps; “even though product by process claims are limited by and defined by the process, determination of patentability is based on the product itself. The patentability of product does not depend on its method of production. If the product in the product by process claim is the same as or obvious from a product of the prior art, the claim is unpatentable even though the prior product was made by a different process. In re Thorpe, 777 F.2d 695, 227 USPQ 964. See also MPEP 2141.02.

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 15-17, 20-22, 28, and 30 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Goodno 5262121 in view of Day 5834082.

Goodno discloses a system that can produce a one piece closed shape structure 10 using a mandrel having a preparing component 20, 18, a first applying component (not numbered but is used to apply the frame mandrel 40, 46, 30 and mandrel 29 (see figure 8), a third applying component 76, a curing component (column 9, lines 58-68), a removing component (column 10,

lines 9-17), an extracting component (columns 9, lines 66-column 10, lines 1-8), a placing and first component not numbered but the results are seen in figure 12 where the structure/mandrel are placed in the bag to the shape of the structure, a sealing component, a placing component, a second conforming component (see figure 12), but is silent on the a second applying component. However, Day discloses that a second applying component is well known (see column 18, lines 57-60).

It would have been obvious to one skilled in the art at the time the invention was made to have used a second applying component in Goodno's system as taught by Day to make a stronger structure.

Re claim 20, when the filling component is used, the compacting component is part of what is shown in figure 8. As more media is used, the more media used will compact. Parts 66, 70 can also be the compacting component.

Re claim 21, the examiner takes official notice that shakers are well known in this day and age (see shakers for mixing paint as one example). One skilled in the art would have used shakers in Goodno's system to aid compaction.

Re claim 22, the first winding component is not numbered but can be seen in figure 11 of Goodno.

Re claim 28, the system can be used to make a fuselage.

Allowable Subject Matter

Claims 45-58, 60 are allowed.

Claims 18, 19, 23-27 are objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

Response to Arguments

Applicant's arguments filed 10/16/07 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

The applicant's argument that Goodno does not teach frame mandrels being applied to the mandrel to form frames for the structure is respectfully disagreed by the examiner. The part 40 is applied to the mandrel 29 so that the structure has a frame 16. This can be seen in figure 11 when the composite material 76 is applied to the mandrel. Part 30 forms the frame that is the vertical part or branch 14 of the structure. Frame mandrel 46 forms the branch 12. These frame mandrels and mandrels together form the structure shown in figure 1. Hence, the examiner maintains that parts 40, 46, and 30 constitute the frame mandrels that are applied to the mandrel 29 that forms the structure.

Conclusion

THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL. Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after

the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Tien Dinh whose telephone number is 571-272-6899. The examiner can normally be reached on 9-6.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Teri Luu can be reached on 571-272-7045. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

Application/Control Number:
10/712,042
Art Unit: 3644

Page 6

td

Two 9h